To Accreditation Council Of Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and health care 04/30/2021

# REPORT OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE INSTITUTIONAL EVALUATION OF THE KAZAKHSTAN MEDICAL UNIVERSITY "KSPH" LLP FOR COMPLIANCE WITH INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION MEDICAL ORGANIZATIONS

Period of external expert evaluation: 04/21/2021 - 04/23/2021

Almaty, 2021

	List of symbols and abbreviations	3
1.	EEC composition	4
2.	General part of the final report of the EEC	
2.1	Representation of LLP Kazakhstan Medical University "KSPH"	7
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	7
2.3	Analysis of the institutional self-assessment report the of LLP Kazakhstan Medical University "KSPH"	
2.4		
3.	Description of the stages of external expert evaluation and conclusion	9
4.	Analysis LLP Kazakhstan Medical University "KSPH" for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results and an overview of the strengths for each standard	
5.	Recommendations for institutional improvement of LLP Kazakhstan Medical University "KSPH"	22
6.	Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council	22
	Attachment 1. Institutional quality profile and external evaluation criteria of LLP Kazakhstan Medical University "KSPH" for compliance with ECAQA Accreditation Standards	24
	Attachment 2. List of documents studied by members of the EEC in the framework of specialized accreditation	25

# LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS:

AD	Administrative department
HEI	Higher educational institution
SAC	State Attestation Commission
SCES	State Compulsory Education Standard
DPE	Department of Postgraduate Education
DSD&QMS	Department of Strategic Development and Quality Management System
DEiF	Department of Economics and Finance
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and
-	Health care
KMU "KSPH"	Kazakhstan Medical University "KSPH"
СТ	Comprehensive testing
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
CE	Comprehensive exam
MoH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
EMC	Educational and Methodological Council
OHPE	Organization of higher and postgraduate education
PHC	Public health care
RDMT	Registration and defense of a master's thesis
RC	Required component
Faculty	Faculty
RK	The Republic of Kazakhstan
Media	Media
TC	Typical curricula
AC	Academic Council
EDS	Electronic digital signature
CBL	Challenge Based Learning
GPA	Grade Point Average
MBA	Master of Business Administration
PhD	Philosophy Doctor
TBL	Team Based Learning
PBL	Problem Based Learning

# 1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 9 dated 03/15/2021, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct in the period 21-23.04.2021 external assessment within the framework of institutional and specialized accreditation of the Limited Liability Partnership "Kazakhstan Medical University" KSPH "



# **Chairperson of the External Expert Commission**

# MORENKO MARINA ALEKSEEVNA

Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Pediatric Diseases with courses of allergology, immunology, hematology and endocrinology of JSC "Astana Medical University"



# **Foreign expert**

### RAKHIMOV BAHODIR BAKHTIYOR ULI,

Doctor of Medical Sciences, Sanitary Doctor, Hygienist and Epidemiologist, Assistant at the School of Public Health of the Tashkent Medical Academy, Researcher at Koryo University



#### National academic expert

ERMUKHANOVA LYUDMILA SERGEEVNA,

Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Public Health and Health care of the NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marata Ospanova ", trainer for training compulsory health insurance in the Western region.



# National academic expert

ZHANKALOVA ZULFIA MEIRKHANOVNA Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of GMT No. 1, NJSC Asfendiyarov KazNMU



# National academic expert

# ZHANTURIEV BOLAT MEIRBEKOVICH

Candidate of Medical Sciences, DBA, Head of the Laboratory of Biological Testing of the Testing Center with Laboratories, the Territorial Branch of Almaty, the National Center for the Expertise of Medicines, Medical Products and Medical Equipment of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan



# National academic expert

ORANBAI LYAZAT ZHADIGERGYZY,

Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Public Health with a course of hygiene and epidemiology, Head of the Residency Department of the National Educational Institution "Kazakh-Russian Medical University"



# National academic expert

PAK LAURA ALEKSEEVNA,

PhD, Director of the Department of Higher Education, Semey Medical University, Chairperson of the State Unitary Enterprise Committee on the specialty "Oncology"



#### **Expert - representative of employers**

#### ALFIA GUMAROVNA SHAMSUTDINOVA,

PhD, Deputy Director for Strategic Development and Education Helmir Hospital, President of the NGO "Association for Bioethics and Medical Law", member of the World Association of Medical Law, the European Association of Pediatrics and Adolescent Gynecology



#### **Expert - representative of undergraduates**

DZHAIMBETOVA ASEL PERNIBAYEVNA, doctor of the highest category, 2-year undergraduate student in the specialty "Management in health care" NJSC Asfendiyarov KazNMU, member of the European Association for Family Planning and Contraception



#### **ECAQA Observer**

UMAROVA MAKPAL ALDIBEKOVNA, Head of the Accreditation and Monitoring Department, Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC (Order of the ECAQA Director general No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an institutional assessment of the Kazakhstan Medical University "KSPH" for compliance with ECAQA Institutional Accreditation standards, recommendations of the EEC on further improving the educational activities of the university in the field of postgraduate education.

#### 2. General part of the final report of the EEC

### 2.1 Presentation LLP Kazakhstan Medical University "KSPH"

LLP Kazakhstan Medical University "KSPH" (hereinafter - LLP KMU "KSPH") was formed in 1997 by the decision of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 1142 dated July 21, 1997 on the basis of the Kazakhstan School of Public Health and is an independent university in the field of health care, carrying out postgraduate education and additional professional education.

KMU "KSPH" LLP is the first educational organization on the territory of the CIS countries and the only one in the Central Asian region, created with the aim of training and retraining specialists in public health, advanced training of heads of health authorities and organizations on topical issues of public health, health policy and management.

KMU "KSPH" LLP carries out postgraduate education and additional professional education in accordance with the State license for educational activities, series No. KZ18LAA00006861, issued by the Committee for Control in Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 21, 2016.

University "KSPH" has been working in the educational services market for over 20 years.

The Higher School of Public Health has become a Kazakh brand in the field of training health managers and public health professionals, specialists in medical and pharmaceutical organizations, government bodies and organizations of the Republic of Kazakhstan and Central Asia.

KMU "KSPH" LLP passed in June 2016 institutional accreditation (certificate of the Independent Kazakh Agency for Quality Assurance in Education dated June 27, 2016, number: IA No. 0075) for the levels of education: Master and Doctorate.

Currently, training at KMU "KSPH" LLP is carried out and is planned from 2021-2022 academic year for 13 educational programmes of scientific, pedagogical and specialized magistracy and doctoral studies (see table below). As part of educational activities, LLP KMU "KSPH" also trains specialists in practical health care, pharmacy and scientific personnel under advanced training and retraining programmes.

No.	Specialty name
1	Master's programme "Public health care" sp
2	Master's programme "Public health" prof.
3	Master's programme "Medicine" sp
4	Master's programme "Medicine" prof.
5	Doctorate "Public Health" sp
6	Master's programme "EMBA"
7	Master's programme "IT Management and Health Care" prof.
8	Master's degree "Hygiene" prof.
9	Master's programme "MPD" sp
10	Master's programme "Epidemiology" prof.
11	Master's programme "Management in health care" prof.
12	Master's programme "Management in health care" sp
13	Doctorate "Medicine" sp

List of educational programmes of the KMU KSPH

LLP KMU "KSPH" is expanding its activities in the regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan: branches are organized and operate in years. Nur-Sultan and Aktau, which contributes to the growth of regional availability of services provided by LLP KMU "KSPH".

In 2020, the quality management system of KMU "KSPH" LLP was certified (by an international certification body - TQCSI, Kazakhstan). As a result of ranking the enterprises of the Republic of Kazakhstan by financial and economic indicators, KMU "KSPH" LLP was awarded the title "Leader of the Year in the National Business Rating - 2017". According to the indicators of scientific and innovative activity for 2019 and the assessment of the dynamics of rating indicators over

the past three years, conducted by the Republican Center for Health Development, in the rating of nonclinical medical science organizations, KMU "KSPH" LLP took 3rd place.

KMU "KSPH" has cooperation agreements with universities in the countries of far and near abroad, including: Hungary - State Cancer Institute, Budapest, Denmark - University of Southern Denmark, Odense, Israel - Carmel MC International Medical Center, Haifa, India - Indian Public Health Foundation, Gurgaon, Italy - Bocconi School of Management, Milan, China – One Belt and One Road Association for International Cooperation, Shenzhen, China - Shenzhen University (SZU), Shenzhen, China - Holding of hospitals in Luohu district of Shenzhen, Kyrgyzstan - State educational institution of higher professional education Kyrgyz-Russian Slavic University, Kyrgyzstan - Kyrgyz State Medical Academy named after I. K. Akhunbaeva,

#### 2.2 Information on previous accreditation

LLP KMU "KSPH" previously passed Institutional accreditation - certificate of institutional accreditation of the Independent Kazakhstan Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education dated June 27, 2016

# 2.3 Analysis of the institutional self-assessment report the of LLP Kazakhstan Medical University "KSPH"

Institutional Self-Assessment Report LLP KMU "KSPH" is presented on 180 pages, including annexes according to relevant standards. The report on the institutional self-assessment is accompanied by a list of members of the working group on preparation for institutional accreditation of KMU "KSPH" LLP, indicating the responsibility of each member of the internal commission; information about the person responsible for conducting a self-assessment for compliance with the Standards of institutional accreditation. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the Rector of PhD Auezova Ardak Mahanbetzhanovna, confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

The report contains information about the representative of KazNMU, who is responsible for the self-assessment of educational programmes, Ph.D. Kauysheva Almagul Amangeldinovna, vice-rector for educational and scientific activities...

The institutional self-assessment of KMU "KSPH" LLP was carried out on the basis of order No. 143n dated November 13, 2020 "On the establishment of a commission for the preparation of Institutional and specialized accreditations."

The report has been prepared in accordance with the Institutional Self-Assessment Guidelines and fully complies with the ECAQA Institutional Accreditation Standards. There is a list of members of the internal self-assessment committee, indicating the responsibilities of each member of the internal committee.

The working group on the preparation of the self-assessment report has done some work: analyzed the key areas of institutional activity and tasks for the implementation of additional education programmes (master's and doctoral studies, including newly developed and licensed master's educational programmes - "EMBA", "IT management and health care" profile direction, "Hygiene" profile direction, "Preventive medicine" scientific and pedagogical direction, "Epidemiology" profile direction, "Management in health care" profile direction, "Management in health care" scientific and pedagogical direction and the Doctorate programme "Medicine" scientifically - pedagogical direction.

The working group also collected the necessary information in accordance with the standards of institutional accreditation; a thorough analysis of methodological and educational materials was carried out; their content is reflected in the report. The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Institutional Accreditation Standards and includes a description of strengths, areas for improvement for each of the 9 standards.

The database, applications are presented in full, sequentially and there are references to them in the text of the report. The report is written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables are drawn up on request, the text contains the necessary links.

# 2.4 General assessment LLP Kazakhstan Medical University "Higher School of Health" for compliance with the standards of institutional accreditation

Based on the analysis of the self-assessment report by experts, it was found that the content of the institutional self-assessment report is structured in accordance with institutional accreditation standards of LLP KMU "KSPH"...

The report is written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables contain references in the text and are consecutively numbered. There are links (access was not limited) to normative legal acts, standard rules, regulations and methodological documents of LLP KMU "KSPH", including EMCD of all specialties.

Personnel training at KMU "KSPH" LLP is carried out according to educational programmes of scientific and pedagogical and specialized master's degrees in the specialties - "Public health", "Management in health care", "Medicine", "Medical and preventive work", "Management of information technologies in health care», "Epidemiology", "Hygiene", as well as doctoral studies in the specialties "Public health" and "Medicine".

The self-assessment and description were carried out in accordance with the criteria of the ECAQA accreditation standards and the questions formulated in the Self-Assessment Guidelines were answered. In all standards of LLP KMU "KSPH" the real practice, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of additional education programmes, international internships, methodological support for advanced training and retraining, confirming compliance with the requirements of institutional accreditation standards. Description of the activity of LLP KMU "KSPH" is fairly completed and updated in term of the number of students, teachers, admission information, certification results, financial information, etc.

Conclusion on each of the 9 standards of institutional accreditation includes a description of the strengths and areas for improvement identified by the accredited organization itself. In accordance with the requirement of the ECAQA Self-Assessment Guidelines, the main copies of documents (organizational structure, registration certificate), which complement the description of the accreditation standards.

So, the self-assessment report LLP KMU "KSPH" contains objective, detailed, structured information on all activities in accordance with the ECAQA institutional accreditation standards.

#### 3. Description of external expert evaluation and conclusion

External expert work on the assessment of compliance with the standards of institutional accreditation of postgraduate programmes KMU "KSPH" LLP was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for conducting an external assessment of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director general of the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care" No. 5 dated February 17, 2017) and according to the program and the schedule approved on 03/15/2021. Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the rector Auezova A.M.

To obtain objective information on the expert assessment of the accredited educational programme, the members of the EEC used the following methods: interviews with management and administrative staff, interviews with undergraduates, observation, study of the website, interviewing employees of various structural units, teachers, questioning teachers and undergraduates, review of resources in the context of fulfilling accreditation standards, studying 77 at educational and methodological documents both before the visit to the university and during the visit.

The team of LLP KMU "KSPH" ensured the presence of all persons indicated in the visit program and according to the lists of interview sites (Table 1).

# Table 1-Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with members of the EEC

Ν	FULL NAME.	Position
0.		

1.	Auezova A.M	Rector
2.	E.L. Stepkina	Vice-rector for development
3.	Kauysheva A.A.	Vice-rector for educational and scientific activities
4.	More than 90 undergraduates	Trainees
5.	About 45 doctoral students	Trainees
6.	Karibaeva I.K	Director of the Department of Science and Consulting
7.	Kasymbekova A.N.	And about. Director of the Department of Postgraduate Education
8.	Minzhasarova K.A.	Director of the Department of International Affairs
9.	Zholdasbekova A.S.	Director of the Department of Strategic Development and QMS
10.	Brimzhanova M.D.	Department of Continuing and Professional Education
11.	F.A. Kadirbekova	CFO
12.	Nauruzov R.	Technical supervisor
13.	More than 40 PPP	Professors, associate professors, assistants of departments
14.	More than 20 employers	Chief doctors, directors of medical organizations, heads of departments
15.	About 30 graduates	Employees of various medical organizations

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is detailed in the Visit Programme, which is located in the documentation of the accreditation center and in the annex to this report.

The first day of the visit is 04/21/2021. The interview with the management and key employees of KMU "KSPH" allowed us to determine the fulfillment of most criteria of accreditation standards 1,2,5,7,8,9, namely, to identify approaches to the development of the mission of the educational program and its compliance with the strategic goals of the university, the role and place of postgraduate education in scientific, pedagogical and profile areas in the university strategy (plan), mechanisms in determining the educational programs of the master's and doctoral programs of the declared specialties, guarantees of the sufficiency of educational resources through the planning of public procurement and the conclusion of agreements with country and international partners (28 contracts). Realizing that the accredited master's degree programs are relatively new, since the first set of students took place in the 2019-2020 academic year, the experts studied in detail the documentation, including the journals of academic performance and attendance (paper and electronic in Platonus), working curricula, syllabuses, control and measuring tools, exam sheets.

The experts found that the university strictly adheres to the requirements of regulatory legal acts and SES in the implementation of educational programmes, and the management systematically monitors this process during internal audits (QMS, mutual control, control of the vice-rector for educational and scientific activities, reporting, etc.) ...

The basis of effective management is the Quality Assurance Policy of LLP KMU "KSPH" and developed at the departments of the magistracy "Policies of the Chairs", as well as adherence to the Quality Guidelines when documenting the educational process.

The conversation with the vice-rectors for educational and scientific activities, as well as strategic development allowed the experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees for teaching undergraduates, on the strategy and tactics of recruiting undergraduates, information security of undergraduates, and also to identify problems in the management and development of human resources, since most of the practicing doctors do not know the teaching methodology.

The day ended with interviewing undergraduates and doctoral students. It should be noted that more than 90 undergraduates and more than 40 doctoral students were present during the interview, that is, more than half of all students, which confirms the enormous interest and patriotism of students, commitment to their university. The interviewees were happy to inform the experts that once they have

enrolled in a master's programme, the majority of students have a desire to continue their studies in doctoral studies or during retraining and advanced training.

### The second day of the visit is 04/22/2021.

This day was devoted to a visit to the postgraduate education department, where employees answered all questions and provided supporting material, demonstrating 100% knowledge of the entire work of the department.

Then the EEC members visited the coworking space, the hostel and the medical office. The coworking center is well equipped and allows you to effectively spend your free time outside of classes. The group of experts also visited a hostel with 8 beds, it was noted that there are renovated, comfortable rooms for living, good sanitary conditions, the ability to use the Internet, washing machines, electric stoves. Each room has 1 maximum of two students. The dormitory also provides rooms for doctors (7 places), improving their qualifications. The experts examined the gym, visited the medical office, which should be noted for the presence of a modern apparatus that allows you to simultaneously measure blood pressure, respiratory rate, saturation, which is very important in diagnosing the state of the respiratory system in students who applied for help.

KMU KSPH has a sufficient number of clinical bases (130 contracts), where students carry out their practical work and collect materials for the preparation of dissertations. The programme of the visit announced a visit to 5 clinical bases, for which the university staff prepared video reviews and organized online connection of undergraduates. In the course of interviews with students, experts established compliance with standard 6 and students' satisfaction with scientific leadership (standard 2.5) and advisory support from the university. Unfortunately, due to quarantine, it was not possible to get to the declared clinical base "Persona", where doctoral students study on the most modern equipment with the resources of accredited educational programmes, their compliance with training courses, accessibility for teachers and students.

The experts obtained evidence of compliance with accreditation standards 2 and 6, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report of the educational programme.

On the same day, a meeting took place with heads and employees of structural divisions involved in the implementation of EP on *Standards 6.8, as well as interview* with teachers, undergraduates and doctoral students, employers (representatives of practical health care). It is necessary to take into account the fact that the graduation from accredited educational programmes.

The experts received answers about the teacher training programme, the financing of this training, and the availability of teachers' certificates in teaching methods. On the same day, experts studied materials on the admission of undergraduates and doctoral students and the selection of teachers, the personnel policy of the university.

In order to validate the fulfillment of the data of the self-assessment report and obtain evidence of the quality of the programmes, interviews with undergraduates were conducted. More than 90 undergraduates and 40 doctoral students attended. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with studying at the university, the adequacy of time for training, work with medical records, as well as satisfaction with teaching methods and the qualifications of teachers. In general, undergraduates are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this university, as they believe that the Higher School of Education has excellent facilities and experience in teaching undergraduates. All students unanimously spoke about the help from the teaching staff on any issues regarding theses, design, preparation of material, etc. Students believe that they will receive a good education and will be able to work independently after graduating from the university.

Doctoral students and undergraduates showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgments on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, opportunities to participate in research and development, funding, etc.). The experts studied the documents of undergraduates, doctoral students (portfolio, assessment results, checklists, questionnaire results).

Online interviews were also conducted with 20 employers in accredited EP of various specialties. The interview included such questions as: knowledge of the university's mission, participation in the

development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the work of the advisory bodies of the Higher School of Public Health, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of undergraduates, participation in the training of undergraduates through mentoring, providing the department and undergraduates with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, employment of graduates of the magistracy, etc.

A review of resources showed that the university has modern, equipped lecture and practical classrooms with interactive whiteboards, projectors, computers with round-the-clock Internet. The training base corresponds the goals and objectives of accredited educational programmes on modern equipment and its availability to all students, and the department staff ensure collegial and ethical relations with the leadership to achieve the final results of the educational programme.

Before the start of the discipline, according to the curriculum of the educational programme, the master student receives a syllabus and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during his studies.

The experience and authority of the Higher School of Education in teaching undergraduates and doctoral students shows a high percentage of employment (100%) of graduates of other graduate programmes and their demand by medical organizations in all regions of Kazakhstan.

Also, a survey of students and teaching staff was carried out, which made it possible to supplement the knowledge of experts on the ongoing educational programme. At the end of the working day, the experts examined the documentation required as supporting documents for self-report.

#### The third day of the visit 04/23/2021

The final day of the experts' work was devoted to the study of the documentation for educational programmes. The experts studied the documentation of the departments implementing the EP "Management in Health care", "Public Health", "Medicine", which confirmed the compliance with accreditation standards (nomenclature of the department's affairs, a plan for 5 years, an annual plan for the 2020-2021 academic year and a report for 2020, progress journal undergraduates and doctoral students, feedback questionnaires with undergraduates, doctoral students, teachers, reports on the results of the questionnaire and the measures taken, the code of ethics, etc., control and measuring instruments), including documentation (77 requests) at the request of EEC members.

The work of the experts was devoted to interviews with the staff of the Higher School of Public Health, studying at the request of the members of the EEC. So, in particular, for a number of accredited educational programmes (Master's degree in Management in Health care, Doctorate in Medicine, Master's degree in Public Health), head teachers and heads of departments of management in health care were invited, materials on the ethical commission were requested, the head of the department was invited personnel and staff of the department of postgraduate education. Further, the experts engaged in the development of recommendations, the final discussion of the results of the external institutional and specialized assessment of the KSPH for compliance with accreditation standards, filling out the quality profile and evaluation criteria for compliance with the ECAQA accreditation standards individually by each member of the EEC. Discussion of recommendations for improving the educational process at the Higher School of Economics. The commission's work was completed by a final vote on each recommendation of all standards for the KSPH.

Chairperson of the EEC, professor Morenko M.A. summarized the data of the EEC members and, together with experts, formed a draft final report of the EEC with recommendations for improving the university. Then, the chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the educational organization announced recommendations on the results of an external assessment in the framework of institutional accreditation and educational programmes for the specialties of magistracy and doctoral studies.

#### **Results of the survey.**

An observer from ECAQA on 21-23.04.2021 conducted an online survey of undergraduates. doctoral students and teachers LLP KMU "KSPH" on the resource <u>https://webanketa.com/</u>...

#### **Results of the survey of master's students:**

The total number of responded master's students - 90... Out of the total number of respondents, master's students of the first year of study prevailed - 96%, master's students of the 2nd year of study accounted for 4%. Will recommend this university as an educational organization - 94% fully agree, partially - 4.85%.

Fully (90.3%) and partially (3.8%) are satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms and classrooms of the university. According to the surveyed master's students, teachers assist in the preparation of scientific work 89.3% (in full) and 7.8% (in part). 93.3% of the respondents have access to the resources of the university, clinics, laboratories where master's theses are prepared. 5.8% are partially satisfied with this indicator.

98% of the respondents agree that the teachers and staff of the Higher School of Education are respectful of the students. 72.8% rate the organization of the university's research practice as "excellent" and 23.3% rate this work as "good".

93.2% of respondents (in full), and 5.8% (in part) believe that the methods of assessing knowledge and skills are fair. Fully 97% and partially 2.9% of respondents believe that the educational programme meets expectations.

91.3% of respondents believe that teachers use active and interactive teaching methods. Fully 94% and partially 5.8% of the respondents are satisfied with the organization of the educational process at the university.

When asked whether the heads or teachers of the university were involved in preparations for accreditation, 22% answered "yes" when preparing the self-assessment report. 11.6% answered that they were involved at all stages of preparation for accreditation. 10.6% refused to participate in the preparation for accreditation for a good reason and 47.64 answered "negative".

#### **Results of the survey of doctoral students:**

According to the results of the survey of doctoral students, the satisfaction with the organization of the educational process at the university was 93.75% (fully) and 6.25% (partially). According to the surveyed doctoral students, teachers assist 89.58% (fully) and 8.3% (partially) in the preparation of scientific work, they do not provide - 2.08% (1 respondent). When assessing the organization of research at the university, 83.33% of respondents noted "excellent", 10.42% - "good". 93.3% of the surveyed doctoral students have access to the resources of the university, clinics, laboratories where dissertations are prepared, 5.8% are partially satisfied with this indicator. When asked whether the staff of the dean's office provides assistance in scientific work, doctoral students answered-85.42% (completely), 10.42% (partially), 2.8% - not satisfied (1 respondent).

When asked whether there is enough time to engage in scientific work and write a dissertation, 70.83% of the respondents answered "completely", 29.17% - "partially". When questioning, 87.5% of doctoral students are fully satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms, classrooms of the university, partially (6.25%). The library fund / resources are satisfied with the question, allowing me to work on my dissertation of high quality 87.5% of doctoral students answered - completely satisfied, 10, 42% - partially, 6.25% - found it difficult to answer.

When clarifying in an interview - are doctoral students the members of advisory bodies (methodological council, academic council, committees of educational programmes), 8.33% answered "yes", 79.17% - "no", 8.33% answered that they had previously accepted participation while studying in the magistracy and 4.7% doubted the answer.

When asked whether the heads or teachers of the university were involved in preparations for accreditation, 18.75% answered "yes" when preparing the self-assessment report. 10.42% answered

that they were involved at all stages of preparation for accreditation. 10.6% refused to participate in the preparation for accreditation for a good reason and 54.17% that were not involved.

#### **Results of a survey of teachers of Master's and Doctoral programmes:**

The total number of teachers on the list is 35. The total number of respondents is 26, including those with up to 5 years of experience - 23%, up to 10 years - 19%, over 10 years - 57%. Of these, the profiles of specialties: therapeutic - 11%, pediatric - 11%, surgical - 3%, obstetrics and gynecology - 3%, other - 69%.

Fully 88% are satisfied with the organization of the educational process, in part - 11%. At the university, ethics is observed and subordination is fully agreed by 92%, partially - 7%. 92% of respondents are completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace, partially 7%. In the organization there is an opportunity for career growth and the development of competence for teachers - 92% fully agree, partially - 3%.

In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research - 96% fully agree, 3% partially disagree. I am satisfied with the salary, 69% agree, 7% disagree.

88% of the respondents are fully satisfied with the work of the HR department, and 7% are partially satisfied. 86% of teachers have completed professional development within the last 5 years. The microclimate in the team is considered satisfactory by 76% of the respondents. 88% completely agree that they can realize themselves as professionals, and 3% - partially.

Students of this educational organization have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training programme, I fully agree - 84, partially - 6%. The execution of applications for the purchase of methodological and didactic materials, office equipment, stationery to ensure the educational process in the organization is considered timely - 92% of respondents, untimely - 7%. The educational organization supports participation in conferences (international, republican): payment of travel, travel, registration fee - 53%, 3% consider self-financing an acceptable option for themselves and 26% do not turn to the management.

The majority of respondents (88%) fully agree, and 3% partially agree that undergraduates have free access to patients and clinic resources. In a practical lesson, teachers provide students primarily with syllables (100%), control and measuring instruments (84%), case studies (69%). 34% of teachers noted that they, as a teacher of clinical discipline, spend 30% of the total amount of time on the theoretical part of the lesson. 15% of teachers noted 50% of the time for theoretical training, 50% refrained from answering.

The level of prior training of undergraduates upon admission to training programmes is fully satisfied by 46% of the respondents, partially - 46%. When asked whether you are a mentor or a mentor of students, 42% indicated that they are mentors or curators, 23% indicated that they are tutors. Is it difficult to combine teaching activities with clinical work in a hospital or polyclinic, 65% answered that they do not engage in clinical work, 26% note the well-organized work organization, and teaching activity prevails -11%.

About the implementation of social programmes to support teachers, 53% know that such programmes exist and 30% do not. 84% of the respondents note that the management of the organization listens to the teachers with regard to issues on the educational process, research and development, clinical work. When asked how you assess your professional level, 76% indicated high and 15% average.

When teaching undergraduates, a variety of teaching methods are used, but more often the analysis of situational tasks (96%), work in small groups (80%), analysis of tests (80%), oral questioning and analysis of the topic (76% and 76%, respectively), interactive teaching (73%), lecturing (69%), less often problem-oriented teaching (57%).

Fully 84% agree that this survey will be useful for developing recommendations for improving the university and master's degree programmes, 11% partially agree with this.

The results of the questionnaire are presented in the attachment and, in general, demonstrate the effective management of educational programmes, the positive aspects of learning on master's programmes, at the same time, identify areas for improvement (social support programmes for teachers, the availability of leadership and administration for teachers and undergraduates, pedagogical competencies and professional development of teachers).

#### Conclusion on the basis of the external evaluation:

Members of the EEC have carefully studied and assessed the main indicators of the accredited educational programmes of magistracy and doctoral studies. The information received by external experts during the study of the self-assessment report, preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, implementation of the activities of the visit programme for LLP KMU "KSPH" was analyzed. All the information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, which made it possible to make sure of the reliability of the information provided by the Higher School of Public Health and the supporting documents for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

Despite the fact that in the self-assessment report of the educational programme of the Higher School of Public Health described its best practice in adherence to accreditation standards, during the external expert evaluation, the members of the EEC studied the main documents (mission, strategic plan, syllables, control and measuring instruments, checklists, portfolio of masters, individual plans of undergraduates and doctoral students for the 2020-2021 academic year, publications of teachers, admission rules, personnel policy, an internal quality assurance system programme, resources (classrooms, office equipment available to students for working with literature, educational and methodological literature), which made it possible to identify compliance of educational organization activities with basic accreditation standards.

The volume of the study load for the sections of the accredited educational programmes is determined by the individual work plan of undergraduates and doctoral students for a set period of study and is monitored by monthly reports of undergraduates and doctoral students. The accounting of completed tasks is drawn up in the form of a portfolio according to the recommendations in the syllabus.

New edition of order No. 647 On approval of state compulsory standards and standard professional training programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties dated July 31, 2015 (as amended by the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 02.21.<u>No. KR</u> DSM-12/2020 reflected in the accredited EP.

The experts took into account the fact that the accredited educational programmes for master's and doctoral studies are drawn up according to the current state educational standard, and are implemented within a specified time. All the necessary documents on the activities of the university, on the EP, educational, methodological, personnel and resource base were assessed for compliance with accreditation standards. Through interviews with teachers and interviews with students, it was possible to determine their direct participation in the development (meetings of departments), the assessment of educational programmes, decision-making on a number of key issues in the choice of student bases, topics of electives, participation in the appeal commissions for the admission and assessment of undergraduates, the development of meaningful parts of individual plans of undergraduates.

At the same time, this substantiated the need for inclusion in post-accreditation monitoring, along with the implementation of the EEC recommendations, an analysis of the implementation of the criteria of Standard 9, an annual report on the contingent of students.

Recommendations for improving the university's activities for compliance with the Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of the expert evaluation, were presented at a meeting with the management on April 23, 2021.

The programme of the 3-day visit of the external expert evaluation of the EEC has been completed in full. On the part of the team of LLP KMU KSPH, the participation of all persons specified in the programme is ensured.

Thus, the external assessment and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the self-assessment report of master's and doctoral programmes in full in accordance with the Regulation on the External Expert Commission, Guidelines for external assessment of a medical organization ECAQA education.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all necessary information and material resources of accredited educational programmes was organized. Experts note the high level of corporate culture and discipline of those responsible for education at the Higher School of Economics, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the members of the EEC.

# 4. Analysis LLP Kazakhstan Medical University "KSPH" for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results and an overview of the strengths for each standard

#### **Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES**

The mission and vision reflect social responsibility, understanding of the mission and significance of KMU "KSPH" LLP in training competent health care professionals of the country, and are consistent with the main directions of programme documents in the field of education, science and health care. KMU "KSPH" LLP has defined its goals and vision of the future: a leading scientific and educational, coordination, methodological and consulting university in the system of postgraduate and additional professional education of medical and pharmaceutical specialists, focused on the generation and transfer of innovative technologies in the field of public health and the development of the health care system.

The university has been assigned serious tasks - to become a leader in the Republic of Kazakhstan and Central Asia in terms of the quality of postgraduate and additional professional education, implemented applied research and consulting projects in the field of health care, which undoubtedly determines the position and potential of the university.

The mission and goals are widely accepted and supported by the administration, employees of LLP KMU "KSPH", teaching staff and students. Information about the Mission, vision and goals is available to all interested parties on the website and social networks of KMU "KSPH" LLP (<u>www.ksph.edu.kz</u>). According to the report, all interested parties (teaching staff and students, employees and employers of LLP KMU "KSPH") took part in the discussion of the mission.

The presented data confirm the facts of compliance with this standard....

#### Strengths:

1. Implementation of EP, developed jointly with stakeholders, with the definition of goals, objectives, learning outcomes and competencies.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 17 standards conform: completely - 10. Significantly - 7, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 1: completed

#### **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROCESS**

LLP KMU "KSPH" ensures the conduct of educational activities within the framework of regulatory and legal acts Of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of health care, medical education. The university prepares undergraduates of the profile and scientific-pedagogical direction and doctoral students, implementing professional educational programmes of applied postgraduate education for personnel training.

The disciplines of the EP magistracy and doctoral studies are developed by the departments in accordance with the strategic development plan of KMU "KSPH" LLP and the wishes of the students, the catalog of elective disciplines, compiled on their basis, is annually approved by the supervising

vice-rector. The elective disciplines that are part of the EP allow you to get an in-depth study of the discipline / topic / issue in the context of the scientific research of students in their future professional employment.

List of competencies for the above EP KMU "KSPH" LLP complies with the approved Classifier of specialties of higher and postgraduate education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, in accordance with the National Qualifications Framework, professional standards and agreed with the Dublin descriptors and the European Qualifications Framework.

Each EP includes the principles of evidence-based medicine and evidence-based practice, which contributes to the development of critical thinking in students and solving problems of the health care system based on analysis.

Teaching and learning methods correspond to the content and final learning outcomes, contribute to the active personal development of the student. To achieve your goals LLP KMU "KSPH" in accordance with the legislation uses various teaching technologies, forms, methods of organizing and monitoring the educational process.

Monitoring of EP implementation is carried out at various levels, by the relevant divisions of LLP KMU "KSPH": departments, department of postgraduate education, educational and methodological council, Academic Council, questionnaires of students, employers, internal and external audits of the quality management system.

To improve and adjust the long-term directions of the EP, the results of feedback from students, employers are used, on the basis of which the correction of educational programmes of disciplines of a compulsory component and electives in all specialties of magistracy and doctoral studies is carried out.

The presented data confirm the facts of compliance with this standard....

#### Strengths:

1. Sensitivity and flexibility of educational programmes in accordance with the needs of society and the labor market.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 14 standards conform: completely - 8, significantly - 6, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 2: completed

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:** 

1. Integrate existing educational programmes with foreign programmes.

#### Standard 3. ASSESSMENT OF STUDENT LEARNING

The Higher School of Education has developed and implemented a policy for assessing undergraduates, which includes the principles and methods of assessment, which are reflected in the "Academic Policy" (dated January 28, 2021). Responsibility for the implementation of the policy for assessing the educational achievements of undergraduates is borne by the teaching staff of the departments, heads of departments (modules), the office of the registrar.

The assessment of the educational achievements of undergraduates covers the assessment of key competencies, and the assessment tools themselves are developed by departments / modules - control questions, tasks in test form (MCQ tasks with several options for correct answers), a list of practical skills, situational tasks, clinical situations. Information about the point-rating system of assessment is posted on the Academic Policy.

As an additional method for evaluating undergraduates, the portfolio is used, which the experts got acquainted with at the Department of Health care Management. Undergraduates are engaged in research work, which must necessarily end with the publication of a scientific article or a report at scientific and practical conferences, the defense of a master's project, in the case of a specialized master's degree and the defense of a master's thesis in the case of a scientific and pedagogical magistracy.

The number of exams in each course is regulated by the Standard Curriculum, which is an integral part of the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan 2015, 2020. for educational

programmes of magistracy. The results of educational achievements of students are entered into an electronic educational journal through the programme "Platonus".

The possibility of an appeal based on the results of the intermediate and final certification of undergraduates is determined in the "Academic policy for 2020-2021 academic year".

Planning procedure, organization, monitoring and analysis of assessment methods in the HSE ensures the reliability and validity of these methods. The development of new control and measuring instruments is carried out by teachers through the study of world experience in the assessment of knowledge in the magistracy, then it is introduced at the department.

The presented data confirm the facts of compliance with this standard....

#### Strengths:

1. Electronic system "Platonus", providing transparency and speed of recording the results of the assessment of undergraduates and doctoral students.

2. A portfolio of undergraduates has been introduced, which allows you to evaluate the development of additional competencies of undergraduate.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 4 standards conform: completely - 2, significantly - 2, partially - 00, do not correspond to -0.

#### **Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1. Provide for the regular analysis and assessment of the quality of the methods used and the format of the assessment for validity and reliability in relation to the established learning outcomes and document them.

#### **Standard 4. STUDENTS**

The policy and criteria for admission to the magistracy of LLP KMU "KSPH" are regulated in accordance with the existing regulatory documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of medical education.

The formation of the contingent of magistracy and doctoral studies at KMU "KSPH" LLP is carried out in accordance with the state order for the training of specialists with postgraduate medical education.

The selection and admission policy are fully consistent with applicable law. The number of admitted undergraduates / doctoral students is planned taking into account the total area of classrooms, the availability of the teaching staff, the availability of educational, methodological and scientific literature, the throughput capacity of the practical bases of LLP KMU "KSPH", the availability of social and living conditions for the training of undergraduates and doctoral students.

LLP KMU "KSPH" guarantees that the adaptation of the admission policy for undergraduates / doctoral students takes place taking into account changing expectations and circumstances, the needs for their own human resources, changes in the postgraduate education system and the introduction of a credit / modular system in educational programmes of magistracy / doctoral studies.

The revision of the policy of admission and recruitment of students at KMU "KSPH" LLP is carried out in case of changes in the NLA MES RK and / or changes in the internal documented procedures.

Students of LLP KMU "KSPH" are represented in the collegial governing bodies of the university: the Academic Council and the Educational and Methodological Council. A representative from the Council of Young Scientists, along with other members of the Academic Council, takes part in the consideration of organizational, economic, administrative issues, and takes part in making decisions about the processes, conditions and rules of education and training at the meetings of the EMC when considering the EP.

LLP KMU "KSPH" pays special attention to the involvement of students in research activities. By participating in research projects, students acquire and develop skills of working in scientific teams, which are one of the most difficult forms of joint human activity in terms of management issues. In addition, it is participation in R&D that allows the development of critical thinking and analysis skills, which are so important for a medical worker.

Also, the university provides individual support to students from the moment of their admission. Students at any time can ask for help from the adviser, any teacher of the department, the head of the department. For the first time, KMU "KSPH" LLP approved a scholarship on a competitive basis "Grant named after Kuralbaev Bekmakhan Sybanbaevich" for citizens of Kazakhstan - for applicants for a master's programme who did not score a threshold score for a state grant, who have excellent academic performance, high motivation and social activity. Social support involves a set of activities accompanying the educational process and aimed at social support for students with disabilities, including assistance in solving everyday problems, organizing accommodation in a hostel, providing social benefits, material assistance,

The presented data confirm the facts of compliance with this standard....

#### Strengths:

1. High commitment and continuity of students to this university.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 14 standards conform: completely 10, significantly - 4, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 4: completed

#### **Standard 5. STAFFING**

The teaching staff is the main resource for the implementation of the mission, strategic directions, goals and objectives of LLP KMU "KSPH". At the departments (clinical and theoretical profiles) there are 76 teachers, of whom, with academic degrees: 16 doctors of sciences, 4 doctors of PhD, 23 candidates of sciences and 16 masters.

The faculty of KMU "KSPH" LLP is included in the international, national organizations and bodies: WHO, CoRSUM, Formulary Commission of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, EBRD, the International Center for the Study of the Quality of Life, the Public Advisory Council of the OSHI Foundation of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Council of Veterans of the Health care System of the Republic of Kazakhstan , a number of employees have received awards and recognition, which is reflected in the attachments of the report.

To create the conditions for the formation of a highly competitive faculty of LLP KMU "KSPH", a personnel policy was developed that allows you to effectively develop human resources, introduce a fair development policy for each employee. At the heart of the formation and implementation of personnel policy, the following principles are highlighted: a democratic approach to the management of teaching staff and employees of LLP KMU "KSPH"; combination of interests of the management team and the managed subsystem; creation of conditions and atmosphere of initiative and creativity; stimulating the activities of the teaching staff; personal improvement of personnel.

The search and selection of personnel for vacant positions in LLP KMU "KSPH" is carried out in accordance with the requirements for the level of qualifications and professional competence of candidates, solely on the basis of his professional qualities, as well as those personal qualities that can be useful when working in the team of LLP KMU "KSPH".

In KMU "KSPH" LLP, the activities of the teaching staff of the departments are planned in accordance with the individual plan, includes educational and methodological, clinical direction (for teaching staff of a clinical profile), research direction and educational work.

Personnel management at the university also includes training and retraining of personnel in order to improve their qualifications in areas of activity, which aims to provide a methodological focus related to the development of innovative technologies, forms, methods and means of teaching.

The professional development of the teaching staff is carried out according to the plans for the advanced training, determined by the departments on the basis of the individual plans of teachers. Evaluation of the effectiveness and efficiency of advanced training is discussed at the meetings of the departments and reflected in the annual reports of the teaching staff and the department.

On an ongoing basis, the university conducts an assessment of the competence of personnel, both when hiring in the form of an interview, and in the process of their teaching activities during a questionnaire survey of students.

The presented data confirm the facts of compliance with this standard....

Strengths:

1. Highly qualified and authoritative teaching staff, implementing educational programmes at the KMU "Higher School of Economics".

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 5 standards conform: completely - 1, significantly - 3, partially - 1, do not correspond - 0.

#### Standard 5: completed

# **Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1. Contribute to improving the level of English among teachers by providing conditions and resources for learning;

2. Encourage and support teachers to improve their pedagogical and professional qualifications.

# Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES, SETTINGS AND SCHOLARSHIP

KMU "KSPH" LLP possesses the necessary electronic resources for the high-quality conduct of training sessions and scientific research. Computer classes, as well as audio-visual interactive means, sufficiently provide educational, scientific processes and management of LLP KMU "KSPH". The university operates electronic platforms "Platonus" and "Moodle", with the help of which the educational process is planned, managed, monitored and controlled. The IS "Moodle" is loaded with all the content on the disciplines of educational programmes for master's and doctoral studies.

In LLP KMU "KSPH" the electronic document management system - Documentolog was introduced. The university carries out work on the timely and high-quality content of the corporate website <u>www.ksps.edu.kz</u>... On an ongoing basis, current news about various events, certification results, past and planned events, including international ones, including conferences and forums, materials of seminars and trainings, and other topics from the life of LLP KMU "KSPH", the country and the world are published.

The library fund of the university has sufficient resources; the library fund is replenished annually. Students are provided with free access to electronic resources: Clarivate Analytics (Thomson Reuters), Springerlink, the Library of the First President of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the National Electronic Library (KazNEB), the Library of the Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Committee on Statistics of the Republic of Kazakhstan, adilet, Za-Zakon, DOAJ, Book.ru , World Digital Library, etc.

During research work, students collect the necessary material as part of their dissertations and projects. LLP KMU "KSPH" signed memorandums of cooperation with leading medical universities and health care organizations, which allows students to conduct research and production practices at the bases of these organizations. In total, since 2015, cooperation agreements have been signed with 130 organizations for students to pass professional and research practice.

In order to study quality assurance, LLP KMU "KSPH" periodically conducts a survey of students to identify the degree of satisfaction with the quality of the services provided.

The presented data confirm the facts of compliance with this standard....

#### Strengths:

1. Updated material and technical base.

2. The presence of a stable relationship with domestic and foreign partners.

3. Full automation of all stages of the organization of the educational process through a single automated information system "Platonus", "Moodle".

4. The electronic document management system "Documentologist" has been introduced and is operating.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 20 standards conform: completely - 7, significantly - 13, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0. **Standard 6:** completed

# Standard 6: completed

#### Standard 7. MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROCESS

LLP KMU "KSPH" in the Rules for the development of educational programmes has established mechanisms for the periodic review, study and evaluation of the implemented educational programmes, which ensures the quality of the programme management process. Educational programmes are regularly studied and evaluated by obtaining feedback from students, teaching staff and stakeholders, including employers, as well as analyzing the educational achievements of students. Stakeholders are involved in the process of evaluating the educational programme - the teaching staff and the administration of KMU "KSPH" LLP, undergraduates, doctoral students and employers. The main tool for involving students in the assessment of educational programmes is a questionnaire survey and participation of representatives of students in the work of the EMC, the Academic Council. The involvement of the teaching staff is carried out through participation in the relevant structures: chair meetings, the work of advisers, extended meetings of the EMC and the Academic Council of LLP KMU "KSPH" and by questioning. Feedback is monitored and is the basis for revising the goals, objectives and activities of the university and the content of the EP.

At the same time, the university does not have a clear assessment of the educational programme, no questionnaires are provided, and an analysis of feedback questionnaires is not provided.

# Strengths:

1. The presence at the university of a dissertation council in the specialty "Public health".

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 12 standards conform: completely - 4, significantly - 8, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

#### Standard 7: completed

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:** 

1. To improve the analysis of the obtained data from the questionnaire survey of stakeholders, reflecting the specifics of specialties and use the results to improve the quality of educational programmes.

#### Standard 8. GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

Management of the educational process is carried out in accordance with the organizational structure, which is approved by the Rector and agreed with the founders. The powers and responsibilities of the administrative and academic staff are regulated by the RLA of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the "Standard Rules for the Activities of Educational Organizations Implementing Educational Programmes of Higher and Postgraduate Education" (Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 30, 2018 No. 595).

The document defining the educational process at the university is the Academic Policy of LLP KMU "Higher School of Education.

Scientific supervision of undergraduates / doctoral students is carried out by leading teachers from among associate professors and professors, PhD LLP KMU "KSPH", corresponding to the qualification requirements of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. During the academic year, control over the timely implementation of the individual master's / doctoral student's plan and the requirements for students is carried out.

The university operates an attestation commission, which works on the basis of "Regulations on the procedure for attestation of teaching staff of LLP KMU "KSPH". The main purpose of certification is to determine the conformity of the teaching staff to the positions held on the basis of a comprehensive and objective assessment of their qualifications, professional competence and business qualities as well determination of the correspondence of the competences of the teaching staff of the university.

IN the university has developed, implemented and certified a quality management system. The quality policy is communicated to all employees, all team members, including management, have committed themselves to participate in the development, maintenance and quality assurance.

The department responsible for the development, implementation and coordination of the developed Quality Assurance Policy is The Department of Strategic Development, which is involved in the development and development of an effective quality management system for all types of

activities of the university, plays an important role in ensuring the quality assurance and transparency of the education system, passing accreditation.

The financial management policy of the university is carried out through the relevant structural divisions: the Department of Economics and Finance, the Administrative Department. The activities of these departments are carried out in accordance with the approved regulations; conducts a pricing policy, develops an estimate, prepares and submits reports on the results of financial and economic activities to the authorized body. Distribution and spending of financial resources is carried out in accordance with the Strategic Development Plan of KMU "KSPH" LLP, operational plans for the development of the university.

At the same time, it should be noted that in the last 5 years there has been a tendency towards a decrease in funding for advanced training of teaching staff.

#### Strengths:

1. Flexible and dynamic management and administration system.

2. Close and effective communication with key stakeholders (alumni, employers).

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of to 21 standards conform: completely - 7, significantly - 14, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

# Standard 8: completed

### **Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1. Develop academic mobility of students and teachers with internal and external partners.

2. Consider the possibility of optimizing the staff structure of the departments "Epidemiology, Evidence-Based Medicine and Biostatistics", "General Hygiene and Ecology" for effective management and support for the implementation of educational programmes.

3. Implement KPIs for administrative and management personnel.

#### **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

Updating the educational programme of disciplines is carried out taking into account the needs of employers and the labor market, as well as in accordance with new regulations.

When developing and changing the educational programme with the participation of associations and employers, they are annually considered at an expanded meeting of the department, taking into account the interests of employers, adjustments are made to the EP and in the content of the taught disciplines. Updating the EP is systematic, taking into account the interests of employers. The conditions for the effective promotion of a student along an individual educational trajectory in order to develop individual characteristics, needs and cultural experience of students meet all the requirements for the implementation of the EP.

The university conducts monitoring, performance evaluation, revision of the EP quality assurance policy based on information management, depending on the requirements of the labor market and the environment. The implementation of the educational programme is based on the maintenance and development of the principles of academic integrity.

The process of constant renewal is carried out through the introduction of innovations and the use of information technologies, problem-oriented learning, the development of assessment methods, the organization of education based on competencies, the expansion of academic mobility, the revision of personnel policy, the improvement of the efficiency of operational processes and the transparency of the decision-making process. The curriculum is assessed and approved, analyzing the degree to which teaching and research methods are in line with European requirements and the requirements of the national health system.

Monitoring of the application of the educational programme is carried out on the basis of the results obtained: academic performance, feedback on the basis of the survey, protocols of departments, reporting of divisions.

Constant renewal and improvement of all types of activities of the KMU "Higher School of Health" is based on a regular and thorough study of models and trends of development and innovations in medical education in different countries. This is achieved by studying specialized literature, inviting

international experts, applying the experience and skills acquired during the academic mobility of students, teachers and administration representatives in leading centers and medical universities in the world. Leaders of educational programmes, all interested persons have the opportunity to participate in conferences, seminars and trainings dedicated to the development of medical education, self-assessment and accreditation processes at the programme and institutional levels, quality assurance in education.

Overall, Standard 9 demonstrates compliance with the requirements for accredited programmes. **Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Conforms out of 4 standards: fully - 3, significantly - 1, partially - 0, do not comply - 0.

Standard 9: completed

#### **Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1. Develop international cooperation in the framework of joint scientific research with the involvement of teachers and students.

2. Promote the implementation of double-degree educational programmes.

3. To assist in the career and professional development of teachers.

Thus, all 9 accreditation standards have been met, no inconsistencies in the fulfillment of the criteria of each of the basic accreditation standards in the process of analyzing the self-assessment report and conducting the examination as part of the tasks of the external expert evaluation programme were found.

# 5. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR INSTITUTIONAL IMPROVEMENT LLP KMU "KSPH":

#### **Standard 2: Educational Process**

2. Integrate existing educational programmes with foreign programmes.

### Standard 3. Assessment Of Student Learning

3. Provide for the regular analysis and assessment of the quality of the methods used and the format of the assessment for validity and reliability in relation to the established learning outcomes and document them.

#### **Standard 5. Staffing**

4. Contribute to improving the level of English among teachers by providing conditions and resources for learning;

5. Encourage and support teachers to improve their pedagogical and professional qualifications. **Standard 7. Monitoring and Evaluation of the Educational Process** 

6. To improve the analysis of the obtained data from the questionnaire survey of stakeholders, reflecting the specifics of specialties and use the results to improve the quality of educational programmes.

#### **Standard 8. Governance and administration**

5. Develop academic mobility of students and teachers with internal and external partners.

6. Consider the possibility of optimizing the staff structure of the departments "Epidemiology, Evidence-Based Medicine and Biostatistics", "General Hygiene and Ecology" for effective management and support for the implementation of educational programmes.

7. Implement KPIs for administrative and management personnel.

#### **Standard 9: Continuous renewal**

8. Develop international cooperation in the framework of joint scientific research with the involvement of teachers and students.

9. Promote the implementation of double-degree educational programmes.

10. Provide assistance in the career and professional development of teachers.

### 6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

Based on the results of the assessment for compliance with the standards of institutional accreditation, the members of the EEC came to a unanimous opinion to recommend the Accreditation Council to accredit LLP Kazakhstan Medical University "KSPH" for a period of 5 years.

Chairperson Morenko Marina Alekseevna Foreign expert Rakhimov Bahodir Bakhtierovich Academic expert Ermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna Academic expert Zhankalova Zulfiya Meyrkhanovna Academic expert Zhanturiev Bolat Meirbekovich Academic expert Orakbay Lyazat Zhadigerkyzy Academic expert Pack of Laura Alekseevna Representative of practical health care Alfiya Gumarovna Shamsutdinova **Resident Representative** Dzhaimbetova Asel Pernebayevna ECAQA Observer Umarova Makpal Aldibekova

Manard

# Attachment 1.

		Evaluation			
Standard	Criteria for evaluation	oincides	ıtly ıds	Partially compliant	match
St	Number of standards = BS * / SU	Totally coincides	Significantly corresponds	Partially	Does not match
1.	MISSION AND OUTCOMES 11/6	10	7		
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROCESS 6/8	8	6		
3.	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENT LEARNING 2/2	2	2		
4.	STUDENTS 8/6	10	4		
5.	STAFFING 2/3	1	3	1	
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES, SETTINGS AND SCHOLARSHIP 11/9	7	13		
7.	MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROCESS 6/6	4	8		
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION 21	7	14		
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL 1/3	3	1		
	Total 54/57 = 111	52	58	1	

# Quality profile and external evaluation criteria (summary) of LLP KMU ''KSPH''

\* BS - the basic standard must be fulfilled by each medical educational organization, and the fulfillment must be demonstrated during an external assessment of the medical educational and scientific organization.

# Attachment 2.

No	Document titles	number	Date of approval
· 1.	Strategic plan	1	02/27/2020
2.	Charter of the educational organization	1	03/27/2019
3.	IEP of undergraduates "Management in health care" -	11	09/01/2020
5.	scientific and pedagogical and specialized directions, doctoral	11	09/01/2020
	students, undergraduates of EP "Medicine", undergraduates		
	"Public health".		
4.	Documents confirming the discussion of the mission with	1	02/06/2020
	interested parties order No. 30n		
5.	List of CED EP Master's and Doctoral Programmes EP	6	09/01/2020
	"Medicine", Master's programmes "Management in Health		
	Care" - scientific, pedagogical and profile directions, Master		
	students "Public Health".		
6.	Supporting documents (acts, etc.) confirming the	1	07/17/2020
	introduction of innovative teaching methods EP		
	"Management in Health Care" - scientific, pedagogical and		
7	profile directions EMC protocol No. 6	20	1.00 1.1
7.	CEP and its control (essays) reports, reviews, projects,	38	different dates
	presentations, conferences, term papers, solution of cases,		
8.	projects - mobile applications EMCD complex for EP magistracy and doctorate EP	11	09/01/2020
0.	"Medicine", magistracy "Management in health care" -	11	09/01/2020
	scientific and pedagogical and profile areas, undergraduates		
	"Public health".		
9.	Annual reports of undergraduates and doctoral students in	11	04/15/2021
	accredited specialties		
10.	Regulation on the organization of professional practice.	1	02/27/2020
	Regulations on the practice of undergraduates		
11.	Diary and report on the practice of a master student	2	03/01/2021
12.	Rules for the development of EP	1	09.11.2020
13.	Individual teacher plan	5	28.08.2020
14.	Applications from the departments of the realizing EP in	3	09/01/2020
	master's and doctoral studies for the purchase of literature		
15.	Regulation on advisers	1	02/10/2020
16.	Syllabuses of disciplines on the EP Master's and Doctoral	11	28.08.2020
	Programmes of the EP "Medicine", Master's Degree		
	"Management in Health Care" - scientific-pedagogical and		
17	profile directions, master's degree students "Public Health".	1	10/02/0010
17.	Regulations on the procedure for competitive replacement of	1	12/23/2019
10	positions of teaching staff and scientific advisers	1	01/12/2020
18.	Regulations on the procedure for training personnel	1	01/13/2020 01/05/2020
19. 20.	Personnel policy The staffing of the departments implementing the EP	1	01/03/2020
20.	Master's and Doctoral Programmes of the EP "Medicine",	1	09/01/2020
	waster's and Doctoral Programmes of the EP Weulchie,		

# List of documents studied as part of the external assessment of LLP KMU KSPH

	the Master's programme "Management in Health Care" -		
	scientific and pedagogical and specialized directions, the		
	Master's degree students "Public Health".		
	health care management		
21.	Inner order rules	1	09.12.2019
22.	EP Master's and Doctoral Programmes EP "Medicine",	10	04/20/2019
	Master's programmes "Management in Health Care" -	10	01/20/2019
	scientific-pedagogical and profile directions, Master's		
	students "Public Health Care".		
	Health care management		
23.	Department regulations	1	12/25/2019
24.	State license for EP	1	04/21/2016
25.	Academic policy	1	01/28/2021
26.	Plagiarism regulation	1	06/11/2020
27.	Regulation on the EMC	1	10/01/2020
28.	Information about the passage of undergraduates of all types	1	12/04/2020
	of practices		
29.	Regulations on the registration of a master's thesis	1	02/28/2020
30.	Regulations on the Local Bioethics Commission	1	02/05/2021
31.	Regulation on scientific leadership	1	06/11/2020
32.	Information about the degree of the Department of	1	09/01/2020
	Management		
33.	Qualification characteristics of the teaching staff of the	1	12/25/2019
	Department of Management (job descriptions)		
34.	Information about the advanced training of the teaching staff	1	no date
	of the department of management in health care for 2 years		
35.	Contracts with internship bases	130	dates are
			different
36.	Regulations on the dissertation council	1	10/28/2020
37.	Organizational structure of branches in Aktau, Nur-Sultan	1	28.08.2020
38.	Regulations on the magistracy	1	09.11.2020
39.	Scientific internship regulation	1	02/10/2020
40.	Planned study hours and credits that count towards the award	1	05/25/2020
	of the degree		
41.	Cost of education	1	-
42.	Regulation on scientific leadership	1	06/11/2020
43.	Regulations on clinical departments	1	12/25/2019
44.	Regulations on theoretical departments	1	12/25/2019
45.	Regulation on the EMC	1	10/01/2020
46.	Regulations on the Scientific Council	1	07/17/2020
47.	Scientific internship regulation	1	02/27/2021
48.	Order on approval of master's and doctoral topics of	1	02.11.2020
	dissertations		